

Stephen James Marshall

Shaping the University of the Future

Using Technology to Catalyse Change
in University Learning and Teaching

 Springer

Preface

This book had its genesis more than 15 years ago with the realisation that, despite significant engagement with the potential offered by technology, the university seemed strangely immune to the potential for change. The e-learning Maturity Model was created in an initially naïve belief that progress would follow from the identification and replication of best practice in the use of technology by the top international universities. The recognition that the problem facing the university is far more complex has seen my research expand beyond the technological, engaging with colleagues in many countries in the exploration of the shared problem we all face in stimulating and supporting change.

The goal of this book is to assist university leaders responding to technological change. Building resilient and agile universities is based on a clear understanding of the complex nature of the existing institution, its students and the organisational context. Universities need to learn how to sustain their relevance in a rapidly changing social, political, economic and technological environment. Effective organizations use technology to shape their operations in ways that build their capability and lead the wider understanding of the role higher education plays in a vibrant and healthy society.

Words like ‘transformation’ and ‘innovation’ are often invoked in a frenzied ritual of organisational behaviour that is driven by technocratic visions amid a sense of unrelenting service to commercial and political prerogatives. Technology, in particular, is positioned as an inevitable trigger of deterministic change, redefining entire industries in ways that make a variety of modern services cheap and ubiquitous. Higher education is not immune to this sense of technocratic predestination as illustrated most recently through the international response to the concept of the massive open online course (MOOC). This book rejects these simplistic linear models of technological transformation and innovation, instead positioning technology as a tool for exploring and understanding the university as a modern institution of society.

The idea of continuous change and organisational agility sustained by an ongoing process of sense-making—a deeper understanding of the nature of the particular organisation’s context and challenges—is a key feature of this book.

Technology provides a lens for re-evaluating and exploring the organisation's activities as well as offering new ideas or possibilities. The opportunities provided by technology enable the organisation to transform itself through a deep understanding of its identity and core purposes, rather than being transformed by technology. Change activities can then provide a means by which continuous engagement in understanding the roles and purposes of the university positions it for the future in a form defined for itself, rather than being determined and controlled by external interests.

Writing a book of this scale is a journey of discovery. Sense-making is both a tool described in this book and a description of its totality. The process of researching, discussing, writing and editing its chapters has been a sense-making journey where the cues have flowed from the conversations with colleagues, both in person and through the longer timescale of the published literature. The bibliography of this book spans millennia, reflecting the ongoing relationship between education and civilisation. Despite the common assumption that engagement with technology inevitably involves new ideas and 'innovation', many of the challenges and ideas engaged in this book have been explored for decades. This implies a mixed set of possible messages. Possibly the university is eternal and the issues discussed merely distractions, but more likely, the exponential and unpredictable pace of technologically catalysed change means that long-standing problems are culminating in a wicked problem requiring a shift in the mindset of university leaders and faculty.

Wellington, New Zealand

Stephen James Marshall

Acknowledgements

Much of the research that lies behind this book was funded by the New Zealand government through a series of different research grants supported through the New Zealand Ministry of Education Tertiary E-Learning Research Fund (TeLRF). Funding was also received from Victoria University of Wellington; Ako Aotearoa, the New Zealand National Centre for Tertiary Teaching Excellence; and the Australasian Council on Open, Distance and E-Learning. This support was essential to the research and is gratefully acknowledged.

The contribution made to the research on higher education change by the leaders and staff of the many institutions who have worked with me over the last decade, including the many colleagues who I work with through ACOE's many activities, is acknowledged with gratitude. I would particularly like to acknowledge my collaborator, Dr. Geoff Mitchell, who was responsible for starting my research down this path and who played a key role in the shaping of the e-learning Maturity Model. I would like to thank Assoc. Prof. Liz Jones and Prof. Barbara Dexter for their support during the years that the book was being written, and Liz particularly for her help in preparing the final manuscript.

Finally, the support and substantial contributions in many different ways made by my wife Deb throughout the long process of writing, and more generally in my academic career, are acknowledged with love.

Contents

1	Introduction	1
1.1	Leading Change in Educational Organisations	2
1.2	The Fallacy of Innovation and Transformational Thinking in the Pursuit of Excellence	4
1.3	Sense-Making: Using Technology as a Trigger for Finding Organisational Meaning	9
1.3.1	Sense-Making Is Social in Nature	9
1.3.2	Sense-Making Is Grounded in Identity Construction	10
1.3.3	Sense-Making Is Retrospective	11
1.3.4	Sense-Making Is Enactive of Sensible Environments	12
1.3.5	Sense-Making Is Ongoing	12
1.3.6	Sense-Making Is Focused on and by Extracted Cues	13
1.3.7	Sense-Making Is Driven by Plausibility Rather Than Accuracy	15
1.3.8	Sense-Giving	15
1.4	Scenarios as Tools for Sense-Making and Sense-Giving	17
1.5	Framing Technologically Catalysed Change in Higher Education as a Wicked Problem	20
1.5.1	Problem Formulation	21
1.5.2	Relationship Between Problem and Solution	21
1.5.3	Testability of Potential Solutions	22
1.5.4	Finality of Problem Resolution	23
1.5.5	Tractability of Problem Elements	23
1.5.6	Explanatory Power of Problem Characteristics	24
1.5.7	Level of Analysis	24
1.5.8	Reproducibility of the Problem	24

- 1.5.9 Replicability of the Problem 25
- 1.5.10 Responsibility for Problem Resolution 25
- 1.6 Structure of the Book 29

Part I Making Sense of the Context for Change in Higher Education

- 2 Part I Introduction 33**
- 3 The Scale and Scope of Higher Education 47**
 - 3.1 Globalisation and International Education 51
 - 3.2 Élite, Mass and Universal Higher Education 57
 - 3.2.1 Access to Higher Education 60
 - 3.2.2 Educational Careers 62
 - 3.2.3 Curriculum Shifts and the Increasing Scope of
Higher Education 63
 - 3.2.4 Relationships with Academic Faculty 64
 - 3.2.5 Organisational Implications of the Shift to Mass
and Universal Modes 67
 - 3.2.6 Coexistence of Élite, Mass and Universal Models 68
 - 3.2.7 Impact on National Education Systems 71
 - 3.3 Conclusion 74
- 4 Internal and External Stakeholders in Higher Education 77**
 - 4.1 Students, Parents, Alumni and Donors 79
 - 4.2 Academic Faculty 82
 - 4.3 Managers, Administrators and Professional Staff 85
 - 4.3.1 The Third Space 87
 - 4.4 Institutions 87
 - 4.5 Employers 88
 - 4.6 Vendors 89
 - 4.6.1 The Business of Online Programme Management
OPM 91
 - 4.7 Government 95
 - 4.8 Society 96
 - 4.9 Non-consuming Stakeholders 97
 - 4.10 Stakeholder Saliency in Élite, Mass and Universal
Education 97
 - 4.11 Conclusion 101
- 5 Financial Challenges, Constraints and Consequences
of Funding Higher Education 103**
 - 5.1 What Does a Degree Cost? 104
 - 5.2 Wealth, Inequality and Student Debt 109
 - 5.3 Higher Education and Productivity Growth 112
 - 5.3.1 Personal Economic Benefit of Higher Education 113

5.3.2	National Economic Benefit of Higher Education	116
5.3.3	Sustaining the Economic Benefit of Higher Education Over a Lifetime	118
5.4	Higher Education’s Cost Disease	119
5.5	Conclusion	120
6	Qualifications as a Defining Feature of Higher Education	123
6.1	Qualifications as Positional Goods	124
6.2	Qualifications as Material Goods—The Myth of Human Capital Theory	128
6.3	Systemic Responses to the Growing Complexity of Qualification Systems	131
6.4	The Declining Value of Formal Qualifications	133
6.5	Conclusion	138
 Part II Technology		
7	Part II Introduction	143
8	Technology as a Catalyst for Change	147
8.1	The Social Impact of Technological Change	149
8.2	Predicting the Future of Technology in a World of Accelerating Change	155
8.3	The Cognitive Challenge of Multiple Time Horizons	160
8.4	Technology as a Platform	162
8.5	Conclusion	166
9	Lessons from the Failure of the Virtual University	167
9.1	Failures	170
9.1.1	Knowledge Universe, UNext and Cardean University	170
9.1.2	AllLearn	171
9.1.3	Fathom	172
9.1.4	Jones International University	173
9.1.5	US Open University	174
9.1.6	The UK eUniversity Worldwide	174
9.1.7	Babson Interactive, NYUOnline and Virtual Temple	176
9.1.8	Universitas 21 Global	177
9.1.9	Global University Alliance	179
9.2	Successes	180
9.2.1	University of Phoenix	180
9.2.2	Western Governors University	181
9.2.3	Capella University	182
9.2.4	eCornell, Penn State World Campus and UMassOnline	183

- 9.3 Making Sense of the Virtual University 184
 - 9.3.1 The Race to Be the First to Succeed 185
 - 9.3.2 Not All Qualifications Are Created Equal 186
 - 9.3.3 The World Is Not That Flat 188
 - 9.3.4 IT Doesn’t Matter 189
 - 9.3.5 Sustaining the Cost of Business in a Dynamic World 190
 - 9.3.6 Managing Collaborations with Diverse Partners 191
 - 9.3.7 Reputations and Brands 192
 - 9.3.8 Faculty Engagement 194
 - 9.3.9 Strategic Vision and Leadership 195
- 9.4 Conclusion 196
- 10 Technology and Modern Students—The Digital Natives Fallacy 197**
 - 10.1 The New Literacies of the Digital World 199
 - 10.2 The Practice Effect 202
 - 10.3 Multitasking 204
 - 10.4 Conclusion: Deconstructing the Technocratic Narrative of the Digital Native 209
- 11 Open Education: A Parable of Change in Higher Education 213**
 - 11.1 What Does ‘Open’ Mean? 215
 - 11.1.1 Open Technology 215
 - 11.1.2 Open Societies 218
 - 11.1.3 Open Democracy 222
 - 11.1.4 Open Economies 223
 - 11.1.5 Open Speech 223
 - 11.1.6 Open Reasoning 225
 - 11.1.7 Open Provision 227
 - 11.2 Massive Open Online Courses 227
 - 11.2.1 The Race to Be the First to Succeed 229
 - 11.2.2 Sustaining the Cost of Business in a Dynamic World 231
 - 11.2.3 IT Doesn’t Matter 233
 - 11.2.4 Faculty Engagement with MOOCs 234
 - 11.2.5 Managing Collaborations with Diverse Partners 235
 - 11.2.6 The World Is Not That Flat 236
 - 11.2.7 Reputations and Brands 238
 - 11.2.8 Not All Qualifications Are Created Equal 238
 - 11.2.9 Strategic Vision and Leadership 241
 - 11.3 Badges and Micro-credentials 243
 - 11.4 Conclusion 247

12 The Modern Technological University 253

12.1 The Impact of Technology on Scholarly Work 254

 12.1.1 Technology Enabled Academic Communities 255

 12.1.2 Technology and Academic Use of Knowledge 256

12.2 Technology and the Evolution of University Teaching 258

 12.2.1 Technology and Numbers 259

 12.2.2 Learning Management Systems and the No
Significant Difference Phenomenon 260

 12.2.3 Clickers and Classroom Feedback Systems 262

12.3 Technology and the Evolution of the University
Infrastructure 264

 12.3.1 Learning Spaces and the Affirmation of the Physical
Campus in a Digital World 264

 12.3.2 Cloud 267

 12.3.3 BYOD: Staff and Students Creating Their Own
Infrastructure 269

12.4 Technology and the Administration of Universities 271

 12.4.1 Learning and Academic Analytics 272

 12.4.2 Ethical and Organisational Challenges Raised
by Analytics 276

12.5 Conclusion: The Role of Technology in the Systemic
Change of Higher Education Organisations 278

Part III Sensemaking and Change in Higher Education

13 Part III Introduction 283

**14 Making Sense of the University’s Purposes, Values
and Culture** 289

14.1 Organisational Values and Culture 291

14.2 Organisational Purposes 295

14.3 Defining the Core Ideology of the University 298

14.4 Organisational Structure and the Management of Higher
Education 300

14.5 ITP-Z Case Study 303

 14.5.1 Reversing the Decline in Capability 306

 14.5.2 Strategic Investment in Key Programmes 306

 14.5.3 Sense-Giving Models 307

 14.5.4 Staff Skills Development 307

 14.5.5 Impact of the Change Activities 309

 14.5.6 Key Lessons 310

14.6 Conclusion 312

15 Quality as Sense-Making 315

15.1 Gresham’s Law, Trust and the Unintended Consequences of
Misaligned Quality Systems 319

- 15.2 Stakeholder Influence on the Definition of Quality 325
- 15.3 Quality Models and Frameworks 329
- 15.4 Quality as Sense-Making 337
 - 15.4.1 Social 338
 - 15.4.2 Identity 338
 - 15.4.3 Retrospective 339
 - 15.4.4 Enactive 339
 - 15.4.5 Ongoing 339
 - 15.4.6 Cues 339
 - 15.4.7 Plausibility 340
 - 15.4.8 Sense-Giving 340
- 15.5 Defining a Framework for Quality as Sense-Making 341
- 15.6 Conclusion: Starting the Quality Sense-Making
Conversation 345
- 16 Using Evidence to Guide Sense-Making 349**
 - 16.1 Quality Indicators 354
 - 16.2 Validation of Quality Frameworks and Indicators 355
 - 16.3 Quality Ranking of Educational Institutions 361
 - 16.4 Total Quality Management 365
 - 16.5 Capability Maturity Models 367
 - 16.6 Case Study: Using the EMM to Analyse a Sector 372
 - 16.7 Collaborative Benchmarking 383
 - 16.8 Conclusion 384
- 17 Making Sense of Change 387**
 - 17.1 Why Change? 392
 - 17.2 Organisational Change Theories 394
 - 17.2.1 Systems Change Models 396
 - 17.2.2 Biological Change Models 397
 - 17.2.3 Rational or Teleological Change Models 398
 - 17.2.4 Institutional, Resource and Contingency Change
Models 399
 - 17.2.5 Political and Psychological Change Models 399
 - 17.2.6 Social, Postmodern and Cultural Models
of Change 400
 - 17.3 Sustaining and Disruptive Change 401
 - 17.4 Conclusion: Change Leadership 406
- Part IV Leading Change in Higher Education Through Sense-Giving**
- 18 Part IV Introduction 411**
- 19 Strategic Planning as Sense-Making 413**
 - 19.1 Strategy and Uncertainty 415

- 19.2 Porters Five Forces as a Tool for Sense-Making 419
 - 19.2.1 Porter’s Threat of Substitute Products 419
 - 19.2.2 Porter’s Threat of New Entrants 421
 - 19.2.3 Porter’s Bargaining Power of Buyers 425
 - 19.2.4 Bargaining Power of Suppliers 426
 - 19.2.5 Rivalry Among Existing Competitors 427
- 19.3 Using the Cues from MOOCs to Illustrate Strategy as Sense-Making 429
 - 19.3.1 Threat of Substitute Products 431
 - 19.3.2 Threat of New Entrants 432
 - 19.3.3 Power of Buyers 433
 - 19.3.4 Bargaining Power of Suppliers 434
 - 19.3.5 Rivalry Among Existing Competitors 434
- 19.4 Conclusion 435
- 20 Futures Scenarios as Tools for Sense-Giving and Sense-Making 437**
 - 20.1 An Introduction to Scenario Modelling for Change 439
 - 20.2 Scenario Modelling Applied to Higher Education Through the Lens of the Forces for Change 441
 - 20.2.1 Adam Smith’s Invisible Hand 441
 - 20.2.2 Cardinal Newman’s Educational Theocracy 447
 - 20.2.3 The Chinese Dragon 449
 - 20.2.4 Dr. Strangelove’s Solution 450
 - 20.2.5 The Digital Agora 452
 - 20.2.6 The Economic Powerhouse 454
 - 20.2.7 The Expanding Universe of H.G. Wells 455
 - 20.2.8 The Ivory Cybertower 457
 - 20.2.9 The Malthusian Collapse 459
 - 20.2.10 Marxist Collective Ownership of Education 461
 - 20.2.11 The Modern Academy 463
 - 20.2.12 Rousseau and the Spiritual Malaise 464
 - 20.2.13 The Star Trek Academy 466
 - 20.2.14 The Technological Singularity 468
 - 20.2.15 Xanadu 471
 - 20.3 Conclusion 473
- 21 Sense-Giving and Leadership 479**
 - 21.1 Bringing a Diverse Group of People with You 480
 - 21.2 Leadership Sense-Giving Strategies in Response to the Forces for Change 481
 - 21.2.1 Scale 483
 - 21.2.2 Stakeholders 484
 - 21.2.3 Finance 485
 - 21.2.4 Qualifications 486

- 21.2.5 Technology 487
- 21.3 Sense-Giving Leadership as an Antidote for Transformation Thinking 489

- Part V Conclusion**
- 22 Conclusion** 495
 - 22.1 Summarising the Wicked Problem 495
 - 22.2 Engaging with the Wicked Problem 501
 - 22.3 Realising a World Without Educational Limits 509
- References** 511