

FIFTH EDITION

Sensory Evaluation Techniques

Morten C. Meilgaard
Gail Vance Civille • B. Thomas Carr



CRC Press

Taylor & Francis Group

Boca Raton London New York

CRC Press is an imprint of the
Taylor & Francis Group, an **informa** business

CONTENTS

Preface to the Fifth Edition	xxi
Authors	xxv
Acknowledgments	xxvii
In Memory of Morten Meilgaard, D.Sc.	xxix
1 Introduction to Sensory Techniques	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Development of Sensory Testing	1
1.3 Human Subjects as Instruments	2
1.3.1 Chain of Sensory Perception	3
1.4 Conducting a Sensory Study	3
References	5
2 Sensory Attributes and the Way We Perceive Them	7
2.1 Introduction	7
2.2 Sensory Attributes	7
2.2.1 Appearance	8
2.2.2 Odor/Aroma/Fragrance	9
2.2.3 Consistency and Texture	10
2.2.4 Flavor	12
2.2.5 Noise	12
2.3 Human Senses	13
2.3.1 Sense of Vision	13
2.3.2 Sense of Touch	14
2.3.3 Olfactory Sense	16
2.3.3.1 General	16
2.3.3.2 Retronasal Odor	18
2.3.3.3 Odor Memory	19
2.3.4 Chemical/Trigeminal Sense	19
2.3.5 Sense of Gustation/Taste	20
2.3.6 Sense of Hearing	23
2.4 Perception at Threshold and Above	24
References	24
3 Controls for Test Room, Products, and Panel	29
3.1 Introduction	29
3.2 Test Controls	29

3.2.1	Development of Test-Room Design	29
3.2.2	Location	30
3.2.3	Test-Room Design	31
3.2.3.1	Booth	31
3.2.3.2	Descriptive Evaluation and Training Area	33
3.2.3.3	Preparation Area	34
3.2.3.4	Office Facilities	34
3.2.3.5	Entrance and Exit Areas	34
3.2.3.6	Storage	34
3.2.4	General Design Factors	35
3.2.4.1	Color and Lighting	35
3.2.4.2	Air Circulation, Temperature, and Humidity	38
3.2.4.3	Construction Materials	38
3.3	Product Controls	38
3.3.1	General Equipment	38
3.3.2	Sample Preparation	39
3.3.2.1	Supplies and Equipment	39
3.3.2.2	Materials	39
3.3.2.3	Preparation Procedures	39
3.3.3	Sample Presentation	40
3.3.3.1	Container, Sample Size, and Other Particulars	40
3.3.3.2	Order, Coding, and Number of Samples	40
3.3.4	Product Sampling	41
3.4	Panelist Controls	41
3.4.1	Panel Training or Orientation	42
3.4.2	Product/Time of Day	42
3.4.3	Panelists/Environment	42
	References	42
4	Factors Influencing Sensory Verdicts	45
4.1	Introduction	45
4.2	Physiological Factors	45
4.2.1	Adaptation	45
4.2.2	Enhancement or Suppression	46
4.3	Psychological Factors	46
4.3.1	Expectation Error	46
4.3.2	Error of Habituation	47
4.3.3	Stimulus Error	47
4.3.4	Logical Error	47
4.3.5	Halo Effect	48
4.3.6	Order of Presentation of Samples	48
4.3.7	Mutual Suggestion	49
4.3.8	Lack of Motivation	49
4.3.9	Capriciousness versus Timidity	49

4.4	Poor Physical Condition	49
	References	50
5	Measuring Responses	51
5.1	Introduction	51
5.2	Psychophysical Theory	54
5.2.1	Fechner's Law	55
5.2.2	Stevens' Law	56
5.2.3	Beidler Model	57
5.3	Classification	59
5.4	Grading	61
5.5	Ranking	62
5.6	Scaling	62
5.6.1	Category Scaling	63
5.6.2	Line Scales	65
5.6.3	Magnitude Estimation Scaling	65
5.6.3.1	Magnitude Estimation versus Category Scaling	66
5.6.3.2	Magnitude Matching (Cross-Modality Matching)	66
5.6.4	Labelled Magnitude Scales (LMS)	67
	References	67
6	Guidelines for Choice of Technique	71
6.1	Introduction	71
6.2	Define the Project Objective	71
6.3	Define the Test Objective	71
6.4	Review Project Objective and Test Objectives: Revise Test Design	78
	Reference	78
7	Overall Difference Tests: Does a Sensory Difference Exist between Samples?	79
7.1	Introduction	79
7.2	Unified Approach to Difference and Similarity Testing	79
7.3	Triangle Test	81
7.3.1	Scope and Application	81
7.3.2	Principle of the Test	81
7.3.3	Test Subjects	82
7.3.4	Test Procedure	82
7.3.5	Analysis and Interpretation of Results	82
7.4	Duo-Trio Test	89
7.4.1	Scope and Application	89
7.4.2	Principle of the Test	89
7.4.3	Test Subjects	89

7.4.4	Test Procedure	90
7.5	Two-out-of-Five Test	97
7.5.1	Scope and Application	97
7.5.2	Principle of the Test	97
7.5.3	Test Subjects	97
7.5.4	Test Procedure	97
7.6	Same/Different Test (or Simple Difference Test)	101
7.6.1	Scope and Application	101
7.6.2	Principle of the Test	101
7.6.3	Test Subjects	101
7.6.4	Test Procedure	101
7.6.5	Analysis and Interpretation of Results	102
7.7	“A”-“Not A” Test	105
7.7.1	Scope and Application	105
7.7.2	Principle of the Test	105
7.7.3	Test Subjects	105
7.7.4	Test Procedure	106
7.7.5	Analysis and Interpretation of Results	106
7.8	Difference-from-Control Test	108
7.8.1	Scope and Application	108
7.8.2	Principle of the Test	109
7.8.3	Test Subjects	109
7.8.4	Test Procedure	109
7.8.5	Analysis and Interpretation of Results	110
7.9	Sequential Tests	117
7.9.1	Scope and Application	117
7.9.2	Principle of the Test	117
7.9.3	Analysis and Interpretation of Results: Parameters of the Test	117
	References	121
8	Attribute Difference Tests: How Does Attribute X Differ between Samples?	123
8.1	Introduction: Paired Comparison Designs	123
8.2	Directional Difference Test: Comparing Two Samples	124
8.2.1	Scope and Application	124
8.2.2	Principle	124
8.2.3	Test Subjects	125
8.2.4	Test Procedure	125
8.3	Specified Method of Tetrads: Comparing Two Samples on a Specified Attribute Using the Method of Tetrads	127
8.3.1	Scope and Application	127
8.3.2	Principle of the Test	128
8.3.3	Test Assessors	128

8.3.4	Test Procedure	128
8.4	Pairwise Ranking Test: Friedman Analysis—Comparing Several Samples in All Possible Pairs	129
8.4.1	Scope and Application	129
8.4.2	Principle of the Test	130
8.4.3	Test Subjects	130
8.4.4	Test Procedure	130
8.5	Introduction: Multisample Difference Tests—Block Designs	133
8.5.1	Complete Block Designs	133
8.5.2	Balanced Incomplete Block (BIB) Designs	133
8.6	Simple Ranking Test: Friedman Analysis: Randomized (Complete) Block Design	134
8.6.1	Scope and Application	134
8.6.2	Principle of the Test	134
8.6.3	Test Subjects	134
8.6.4	Test Procedure	134
8.6.5	Analysis and Interpretation of Results	135
8.7	Multisample Difference Test: Rating Approach—Evaluation by Analysis of Variance (ANOVA)	139
8.7.1	Scope and Application	139
8.7.2	Principle of the Test	139
8.7.3	Test Subjects	139
8.7.4	Test Procedure	139
8.7.5	Analysis and Interpretation of Results	139
8.8	Multisample Difference Test: BIB Ranking Test (Balanced Incomplete Block Design)—Friedman Analysis	142
8.8.1	Scope and Application	142
8.8.2	Principle of the Test	142
8.8.3	Test Subjects	143
8.8.4	Test Procedure	143
8.9	Multisample Difference Test: BIB Rating Test—Evaluation by Analysis of Variance	147
8.9.1	Scope and Application	147
8.9.2	Principle of the Test	148
8.9.3	Test Subjects	148
8.9.4	Test Procedure	148
8.9.5	Analysis and Interpretation of Results	149
	References	151
9	Determining Threshold	153
9.1	Introduction	153
9.2	Definitions	154
9.3	Applications of Threshold Determinations	156
	References	163

10	Selection and Training of Panel Members	165
10.1	Introduction	165
10.2	Panel Development	166
10.2.1	Personnel	166
10.2.1.1	Special Considerations for a Quality Control/Quality Assurance (QC/QA) Panel	167
10.2.2	Facilities	167
10.2.3	Data Collection and Handling	167
10.2.4	Projected Costs	167
10.3	Selection and Training for Difference Tests	168
10.3.1	Selection	168
10.3.1.1	Matching Tests	168
10.3.1.2	Detection/Discrimination Tests	169
10.3.1.3	Ranking/Rating Tests for Intensity	170
10.3.1.4	Interpretation of Results of Screening Tests	172
10.3.2	Training	172
10.4	Selection and Training of Panelists for Descriptive Testing	173
10.4.1	Recruiting Descriptive Panelists	173
10.4.2	Selection for Descriptive Testing	174
10.4.2.1	Prescreening Questionnaires	175
10.4.2.2	Acuity Tests	175
10.4.2.3	Ranking/Rating Screening Tests for Descriptive Analysis	176
10.4.2.4	Personal Interview	176
10.4.2.5	Mock Panel	176
10.4.3	Training for Descriptive Testing	177
10.4.3.1	Terminology Development	177
10.4.3.2	Introduction to Descriptive Scaling	178
10.4.3.3	Initial Practice	178
10.4.3.4	Small Product Differences	179
10.4.3.5	Final Practice	179
10.5	Panel Performance and Motivation	179
10.5.1	Performance	179
10.5.2	Panelist Maintenance, Feedback, Rewards, and Motivation	182
	Appendix 10.1 Prescreening Questionnaires	184
	Appendix 10.2 Panel Leadership Advice	192
	References	198
11	Descriptive Analysis Techniques	201
11.1	Definition	201
11.2	Field of Application	202
11.3	Components of Descriptive Analysis	202
11.3.1	Characteristics: The Qualitative Aspect	202
11.3.2	Intensity: The Quantitative Aspect	204

11.3.3	Order of Appearance: The Time Aspect	205
11.3.4	Overall Impression: The Integrated Aspect	205
11.4	Commonly Used Descriptive Test Methods with Trained Panels	207
11.4.1	Flavor Profile Method	207
11.4.2	Texture Profile Method	208
11.4.3	Quantitative Descriptive Analysis (QDA®) Method	209
11.4.4	Spectrum™ Descriptive Analysis Method	210
11.4.5	Time–Intensity Descriptive Analysis	211
11.4.5.1	Fixed-Time-Point Methods	211
11.4.5.2	Continuous Measurement Methods	211
11.5	Commonly Used Descriptive Test Methods with Untrained Panels	214
11.5.1	Free-Choice Profiling	214
11.5.2	Flash Profiling	214
11.5.3	Projective Mapping (Napping)	214
11.5.4	Sorting	215
11.6	Application of Descriptive Analysis Panel Data	215
	References	219
12	Spectrum™ Descriptive Analysis Method	223
12.1	Designing a Descriptive Method	223
12.2	Myths about the Spectrum Descriptive Analysis Method	224
12.2.1	Myth 1: All Descriptive Methods Are the Same	224
12.2.2	Myth 2: Concept Development Is Unnecessary in Training a Spectrum Panel	224
12.2.3	Myth 3: All Spectrum Training and Panel Leaders Are the Same; Anyone Can Do It	225
12.2.4	Myth 4: Consumer Terms Are Better than Technical Terms	225
12.2.5	Myth 5: Spectrum Panelists Are Forced to Use Canned Lexicons	225
12.2.6	Myth 6: Spectrum Panelists Are Coerced into Intensity Calibration	225
12.2.7	Myth 7: The Universal Scale Cannot Show Small Differences	226
12.2.8	Myth 8: Published References and Terms Are the Equivalent of a Training Manual	226
12.2.9	Myth 9: Product Users Make the Best Panelists and Hedonics Influence Panel Ratings	226
12.2.10	Myth 10: Panelists Cannot Be Trained for an Array of Products	226
12.2.11	Myth 11: Training for the Spectrum Method Is Too Time-Intensive	226
12.2.12	Myth 12: The Spectrum Method Is Consensus Only	227
12.2.13	Myth 13: Consensus Profiling Prevents Statistical Analysis of Panel Data	227
12.2.14	Myth 14: Difficult-to-Find References Prevent Universality of the Spectrum Scale	227
12.3	Terminology and Lexicon Development	227
12.4	Intensity	229
12.5	Combining the Spectrum Descriptive Analysis Method with Other Measures	231
12.5.1	Using the Spectrum Method Simultaneously with Other Methods	231
12.5.2	Combining the Spectrum Method with Other Sources of Sensory Data	233
12.6	Spectrum Descriptive Procedures for Quality Assurance, Shelf-Life Studies, and So On	233
	References	233
	Appendix 12.1 Spectrum Terminology for Descriptive Analysis	235

Appendix 12.2 Spectrum Intensity Scales for Descriptive Analysis	258
Appendix 12.3 Streamlined Approach to Spectrum References	272
Appendix 12.4 Spectrum Descriptive Analysis: Product Lexicons	282
Appendix 12.5 Spectrum Descriptive Analysis: Examples of Full Product Descriptions	292
Appendix 12.6 Spectrum Descriptive Analysis Training Exercises	299
13 Affective Tests: Consumer Tests and In-House Panel Acceptance Tests	307
13.1 Purpose and Applications	307
13.1.1 Product Maintenance	309
13.1.2 Product Improvement/Optimization	309
13.1.3 Development of New Products	310
13.1.4 Assessment of Market Potential	311
13.1.5 Category Review/Benchmarking	311
13.1.6 Support for Advertising Claims	311
13.1.7 Uncovering Consumer Needs	312
13.2 Subjects/Consumers in Affective Tests	312
13.2.1 Sampling and Demographics	312
13.2.1.1 User Group	313
13.2.1.2 Age	313
13.2.1.3 Gender	313
13.2.1.4 Income	314
13.2.1.5 Geographic Location	314
13.2.2 Source of Test Subjects	314
13.2.2.1 Employees	314
13.2.2.2 Local Area Residents	315
13.2.2.3 General Population	315
13.3 Choice of Test Location	316
13.3.1 Laboratory Tests	316
13.3.2 Central Location Tests	316
13.3.3 Home Use Tests	317
13.4 Affective Methods: Qualitative	318
13.4.1 Applications	318
13.4.2 Qualitative Screener Development	319
13.4.3 Types of Qualitative Affective Tests	319
13.4.3.1 Focus Groups	319
13.4.3.2 Focus Panels	320
13.4.3.3 Mini Groups, Diads, Triads	320
13.4.3.4 One-on-One Interviews	320
13.5 Affective Methods: Quantitative	321
13.5.1 Applications	321
13.5.2 Design of Quantitative Affective Tests	321
13.5.2.1 Quantitative Screener Development	321
13.5.2.2 Questionnaire Design	321

13.5.2.3	Protocol Design	322
13.5.3	Types of Quantitative Affective Tests	323
13.5.3.1	Preference Tests	324
13.5.3.2	Acceptance Tests	325
13.5.4	Assessment of Individual Attributes (Attribute Diagnostics)	328
13.5.5	Other Information	330
13.6	Internet Research	331
13.6.1	Introduction	331
13.6.2	Applications	331
13.6.3	Design of Internet Research	332
13.6.4	Internet Research Considerations	333
13.6.4.1	Benefits and Pitfalls of Using the Internet for Research	333
13.6.4.2	Platform	335
13.6.4.3	Recommendations and Checks & Balances	335
Case Study: Internet Research		335
13.7	Using Other Sensory Methods to Uncover Insights	338
13.7.1	Relating Affective and Descriptive Data	338
Case Study: Relating Consumer Qualitative Information with Descriptive Analysis Data		339
13.7.2	Using Affective Data to Define Shelf-Life or Quality Limits	340
13.7.3	Rapid Prototype Development	343
Appendix 13.1	Screeners for Consumer Studies—Focus Group, CLT, and Home Use Test (HUT)	345
Appendix 13.2	Discussion Guide—Group or One-on-One Interviews	349
Appendix 13.3	Questionnaires for Consumer Studies	351
Appendix 13.4	Protocol Design for Consumer Studies	356
References		359
14	Basic Statistical Methods	361
14.1	Introduction	361
14.2	Summarizing Sensory Data	362
14.2.1	Summary Analysis of Data in the Form of Ratings	364
14.2.2	Estimating the Proportion of a Population That Possesses a Particular Characteristic	365
14.2.3	Confidence Intervals on μ and p	366
14.2.4	Other Interval Estimates	371
14.2.5	Data Transformations	371
14.3	Statistical Hypothesis Testing	372
14.3.1	Statistical Hypotheses	373
14.3.2	One-Sided and Two-Sided Hypotheses	373
14.3.3	Type I and Type II Errors	374
14.3.4	Examples: Tests on Means, Standard Deviations, and Proportions	375
14.3.5	Calculating Sample Sizes in Discrimination Tests	382
14.4	Thurstonian Scaling	384

14.4.1	A Fundamental Measure of Sensory Differences	384
14.4.2	Decision Rules in Sensory Discrimination Tests	386
14.4.3	Estimating the Value of δ	387
14.4.3.1	Forced-Choice Methods	387
14.4.3.2	Methods Using Scales	388
14.4.4	Transitioning from Percent-Distinguisher Model to the Thurstonian Model for Planning Discrimination Tests	389
14.5	Statistical Design of Sensory Panel Studies	390
14.5.1	Sampling: Replication versus Multiple Observations	390
14.5.2	Blocking an Experimental Design	392
14.5.2.1	Completely Randomized Designs	392
14.5.3	Randomized (Complete) Block Designs	394
14.5.3.1	Randomized Block Analysis of Ratings	394
14.5.3.2	Randomized Block Analysis of Rank Data	395
14.5.4	Balanced Incomplete Block Designs	396
14.5.4.1	BIB Analysis of Ratings	397
14.5.4.2	BIB Analysis of Rank Data	398
14.5.5	Latin-Square Designs	399
14.5.6	Split-Plot Designs	399
14.5.6.1	Split-Plot Analysis of Ratings	401
14.5.7	A Simultaneous Multiple Comparison Procedure	402
Appendix 14.1	Probability	403
References		408
15	Advanced Statistical Methods	411
15.1	Introduction	411
15.2	Data Relationships	411
15.2.1	All Independent Variables	412
15.2.1.1	Correlation Analysis	412
15.2.1.2	Principal Components Analysis	414
15.2.1.3	Multidimensional Scaling	416
15.2.1.4	Cluster Analysis	419
15.2.2	Dependent and Independent Variables	423
15.2.2.1	Regression Analysis	423
15.2.2.2	Principal Component Regression	430
15.2.2.3	Partial Least-Squares Regression	431
15.2.2.4	Discriminant Analysis	432
15.3	Preference Mapping	434
15.3.1	Internal Preference Mapping	435
15.3.2	External Preference Mapping	439
15.3.2.1	Constructing the Perceptual Map of the Product Space	439
15.3.2.2	Identifying Preference Segments	445
15.3.2.3	From Perceptual Map to Preference Map	446

15.3.2.4	Reverse Engineering the Profile of the Target Product	448
15.3.2.5	External Preference Mapping of Individual Respondents	449
15.3.3	Partial Least-Squares Mapping	450
15.4	Treatment Structure of an Experimental Design	452
15.4.1	Factorial Treatment Structures	452
15.4.2	Fractional Factorials and Screening Studies	456
15.4.2.1	Constructing Fractional Factorials	456
15.4.2.2	Plackett–Burman Experiments	458
15.4.2.3	Computer-Aided Optimal Fractional Designs	459
15.4.2.4	Analysis of Screening Studies	459
15.4.3	Conjoint Analysis	461
15.4.4	Response Surface Methodology	462
References		466
16	Guidelines for Reporting Results	469
16.1	Introduction	469
16.1.1	Rationale	469
16.1.2	Qualities of a Good Report	469
16.2	Anatomy of the Report	470
16.2.1	Part 1: Summary or Abstract	470
16.2.2	Part 2: Objectives and Introduction	471
16.2.3	Part 3: Materials and Methods	471
16.2.4	Part 4: Results and Discussion	472
16.3	Graphical Presentation of Data	472
16.3.1	Introduction	472
16.3.2	General Guidelines for Graphing Data	475
16.3.3	Appropriateness of Graphs	476
16.3.4	Common Graphs and Examples	476
16.4	Example Reports	478
References		491
17	Sensory Evaluation in Quality Control (QC/Sensory)	493
17.1	Introduction	493
17.2	Attribute Descriptive Methods	494
17.2.1	Establishing Sensory Specifications	494
17.2.1.1	Initial Sample Screening	495
17.2.1.2	Sensory Descriptive Evaluations and Sample Selection for Consumer Testing	495
17.2.1.3	Consumer Testing Production Samples	497
17.2.1.4	Establishing the Sensory Specifications	499
17.2.2	Implementing the In-Plant QC/Sensory Function	501
17.2.3	Product Sampling, Data Analysis, and Reporting	502
17.3	Difference-from-Control Methods	503

17.3.1	Establishing Sensory Specifications	505
17.3.2	Implementing the In-Plant QC/Sensory Function	507
17.3.3	Product Sampling, Data Analysis, and Reporting	508
17.4	In-Out Method	509
17.4.1	Establishing Sensory Specifications	509
17.4.2	Implementing the In-Plant QC/Sensory Function	510
17.4.3	Product Sampling, Data Analysis, and Reporting	510
References		511
18	Advanced Consumer Research Techniques	513
18.1	Introduction	513
18.2	Front End of Innovation	514
18.2.1	Definition, Purpose, Outcome	514
18.2.2	Applications	514
18.2.3	Tools and Techniques	514
18.2.4	Design of Front-End Innovation Research	516
18.2.5	Data Analysis and Mining	516
18.2.5.1	Case Study: Understanding Consumer Perception of Crispy and Crunchy	517
18.3	Sequence Mapping	517
18.4	Capturing the Iconic Experience	520
18.4.1	Definition and Purpose or Scope	520
18.4.2	Applications	520
18.4.2	Design of Research	521
18.4.3	Tools and Techniques	522
18.4.4	Data Analysis and Mining/Conclusions	522
18.5	Consumer Cocreation	522
18.6	Qualitative Use of Kano Methodology	524
18.7	Benefit Perception beyond Liking: Functional, Emotional, and Health and Wellness Benefits	526
18.7.1	Definition and Purpose or Scope	526
18.7.2	Tools and Techniques	526
18.7.3	Applications	527
18.7.4	Design of Research	527
18.7.5	Conclusions	529
18.8	Behavioral Economics	529
18.9	Category Appraisals, Key Drivers Studies and Sensory Segmentation	530
18.9.1	Definition and Purpose or Scope	530
18.9.2	Design and Benefits of the Research	531
18.9.2.1	Phase I: Defining the Limits of the Category	531
18.9.2.2	Phase II: Documentation of Product Characteristics, Competitive Intelligence and Selection of Products for Consumer Testing	532
18.9.2.3	Phase III: Determining Consumer Acceptance and Perception of the Products in the Category	533

18.9.2.4	Phase IV: Identifying Key Drivers, Drivers of Benefit Perception, and Strategic Product Guidance	533
18.9.3	Conclusion	534
18.10	Ad Claims	534
18.10.1	Introduction	534
18.10.2	Types of Claims	534
18.10.3	Types of Claims Testing	535
18.10.4	Building the Case	535
18.10.5	Cautions and Things to Consider	536
	Additional Resources	536
	References	538
19	Statistical Tables	539
20	Practical Sensory Problems	565
	Scenario 1	565
	Scenario 2	567
	Scenario 3	572
	Scenario 4	577
	Scenario 5	586
	References	588
	Additional Qualitative References	588
	Index	589