

Sensory Evaluation Techniques

Fourth Edition

Morten Meilgaard, D.Sc.

Senior Technical Advisor
The Stroh Brewery Company
Detroit, Michigan

Gail Vance Civile, B.S.

President
Sensory Spectrum, Inc.
New Providence, New Jersey

B. Thomas Carr, M.S.

Principal
Carr Consulting
Wilmette, Illinois



CRC Press

Taylor & Francis Group
Boca Raton London New York

CRC Press is an imprint of the
Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business

Preface

How does one plan, execute, complete, analyze, interpret, and report sensory tests? Hopefully, the practices and recommendations in this book cover all of those phases of sensory evaluation. The text is meant as a personal reference volume for food scientists, research and development scientists, cereal chemists, perfumers, and other professionals working in industry, academia, or government who need to conduct good sensory evaluation. The book should also supply useful background to marketing research, advertising, and legal professionals who need to understand the results of sensory evaluation. It could also give a sophisticated general reader the same understanding.

Because the first edition was used as a textbook at the university and professional levels, partly in courses taught by the authors, the second, third, and fourth editions incorporate a growing number of ideas and improvements arising out of questions from students. The objective of the book is now twofold. First, as a “how to” text for professionals, it aims for a clear and concise presentation of practical solutions, accepted methods, and standard practices. Second, as a textbook for courses at the academic level, it aims to provide just enough theoretical background to enable the student to understand which sensory methods are best suited to particular research problems and situations and how tests can best be implemented.

The authors do not intend to devote text and readers’ time to resolving controversial issues, but a few had to be tackled. The second edition was the first book to provide an adequate solution to the problem of similarity testing. This was adopted and further developed by ISO TC34/SC12 on Sensory Evaluation, resulting in the current “unified” procedure (Chapter 6, Section II, p. 60) in which the user’s choice of α - and β -risks defines whether difference or similarity is tested for. Another first is the unified treatment of all ranking tests with the Friedman statistic in preference to Kramer’s tables.

Chapter 11 on the Spectrum™ method of descriptive sensory analysis, developed by Civile, has been expanded. The philosophy behind Spectrum is threefold: (1) the test should be tailored to suit the objective of the study (and not to suit a prescribed format); (2) the choice of terminology and reference standards should make use not only of the senses and imagination of the panelists, but also of the accumulated experience of the sensory profession as recorded in the literature; and (3) a set of calibrated intensity scales is provided that permits different panels at different times and locations to obtain comparable and reproducible profiles. The chapter now contains full descriptive lexicons suitable for descriptive analysis of a number of products, e.g., cheese, mayonnaise, spaghetti sauce, white bread, cookies, and toothpaste. Also new is a set of revised flavor intensity scales for attributes such as crispness, juiciness, and some common aromatics and two training exercises.

The authors wish the book to be cohesive and readable; we have tried to substantiate our directions and organize each section so as to be meaningful. We do not want the book to be a turgid set of tables, lists, and figures. We hope we have provided structure to the methods, reason to the procedures, and coherence to the outcomes. Although our aim is to describe all tests in current use, we want this to be a reference book that can be read for understanding as well as a handbook that can serve to describe all major sensory evaluation practices.

The organization of the chapters and sections is also straightforward. Chapter 1 lists the steps involved in a sensory evaluation project, and Chapter 2 briefly reviews the workings of our senses. In Chapter 3, we list what is required of the equipment, the tasters, and the samples; while in Chapter 4, we have collected a list of those psychological pitfalls that invalidate many otherwise good studies. Chapter 5 discusses how sensory responses can be measured in quantitative terms. In Chapter 6, we describe all the common sensory tests for difference, the Triangle, Duo–trio, etc.; and, in Chapter 7, the various attribute tests, such as ranking and numerical intensity scaling, are discussed. Thresholds and just-noticeable differences are briefly discussed in Chapter 8, followed by what we consider the main chapters: Chapter 9 on selection and training of tasters, Chapters 10 and 11 on descriptive testing, and Chapter 12 on affective tests (consumer tests). All the descriptive references have been reviewed and revised for the Spectrum references in Chapter 11. Chapter 12 defines, in detail, several qualitative and quantitative classic methods for testing with consumers and includes substantial reviews of “fuzzy front end” and internet research techniques.

The body of text on statistical procedures is found in Chapters 13 and 14, but, in addition, each method (Triangle, Duo–trio, etc.) in Chapters 6 and 7 is followed by a number of examples showing how statistics are used in the interpretation of each. Basic concepts for tabular and graphical summaries, hypothesis testing, and the design of sensory panels are presented in Chapter 13. We refrain from detailed discussion of statistical theory, preferring instead to give examples. Chapter 14 discusses multifactor experiments that can be used, for example, to screen for variables that have large effects on a product, to identify variables that interact with each other in how they affect product characteristics, or to identify the combination of variables that maximize some desirable product characteristic such as consumer acceptability. Chapter 14 also contains a discussion of multivariate techniques that can be used to summarize large numbers of responses with fewer, meaningful ones to identify relationships among responses that might otherwise go unnoticed, and to group respondents of samples that exhibit similar patterns of behavior. New in the fourth edition is an overview of Thurstonian Scaling. In addition to studying differences among products, Thurstonian Scaling can be used to uncover the decision processes used by assessors during their evaluations of products. Also new in the fourth edition is a detailed discussion of data-relationship techniques used to link data from diverse sources collected on the same set of samples. The techniques are used to identify relationships, for example, between instrumental and sensory data or between sensory and consumer data. They can reveal the sensory and instrumental characteristics of products that have the greatest impact on acceptance and the intensities of these characteristics that are predicted to be most well liked by consumers.

At the end of the book, the reader will find guidelines for the choice of techniques and for reporting results plus the usual glossaries, indexes, and statistical tables.

With regard to terminology, the terms *assessor*, *judge*, *panelist*, *respondent*, *subject*, and *taster* are used interchangeably as are *he*, *she*, and *(s)he* for the sensory analyst (the sensory professional, the panel leader) and for individual panel members.

Authors

Morten C. Meilgaard, M.Sc., D.Sc., F.I. Brew, is visiting professor (emeritus) of Sensory Science at the Agricultural University of Denmark, and he is senior technical advisor and vice president of research (also emeritus) at the Stroh Brewery Co., Detroit, Michigan. He studied biochemistry and engineering at the Technical University of Denmark where he returned in 1982 to receive a doctorate for a dissertation on beer flavor compounds and their interactions. After 6 years as a chemist at the Carlsberg Breweries, he worked from 1957 to 1967 and again from 1989 as a worldwide consultant on brewing and sensory testing. He served for 6 years as director of research for Cervecería Cuauhtémoc in Monterrey, Mexico, and for 25 years with Stroh. At the Agricultural University of Denmark, his task was to establish sensory science as an academic discipline for research and teaching.

Dr. Meilgaard's professional interests are the biochemical and physiological basis of flavor, and more specifically, the flavor compounds of hops and beer and the methods by which they can be identified, namely, chemical analysis coupled with sensory evaluation techniques. He has published over 70 papers. He is the recipient of the Schwarz Award and the Master Brewers Association Award of Merit for studies of compounds that affect beer flavor. He is the founder and past president of the Hop Research Council of the U.S., and he is the past chairman of the Scientific Advisory Committee of the U.S. Brewers Association. For 14 years, he was chairman of the Subcommittee on Sensory Analysis of the American Society of Brewing Chemists. He has chaired the U.S. delegation to the ISO TC34/SC12 Subcommittee on Sensory Evaluation.

Gail Vance Civile, B.S., is president of Sensory Spectrum, Inc., New Providence, New Jersey, a management consulting firm involved in the field of sensory evaluation of foods, beverages, pharmaceuticals, paper, fabrics, personal care, and other consumer products. Sensory Spectrum provides guidance in the selection, implementation, and analysis of test methods for solving problems in quality control, research, development, production, and marketing. She has trained several flavor and texture descriptive profile panels in her work with industry, universities, and government.

As a course director for the Center for Professional Advancement and Sensory Spectrum, Ms. Civile has conducted several workshops and courses in basic sensory evaluation methods as well as advanced methods and theory. In addition, she has been invited to speak to several professional organizations on different facets of sensory evaluation.

Ms. Civile has published several articles on general sensory methods as well as sophisticated descriptive flavor and texture techniques. A graduate of the College of Mount Saint Vincent, New York, with a B.S. in chemistry, Ms. Civile began her career as a product evaluation analyst with the General Foods Corporation.

B. Thomas Carr, M.A., is principal of Carr Consulting, Wilmette, Illinois, a research consulting firm that provides project management, product evaluation, and statistical support services to the food, beverage, personal care, and home care industries. He has over 18 years of experience in applying statistical techniques to all phases of research on consumer products. Prior to founding Carr Consulting, Mr. Carr held a variety of business and technical positions in the food and food ingredient industries. As director of Contract

Research for NSC Technologies/NutraSweet, he identified and coordinated outside research projects that leveraged the technical capabilities of all the groups within NutraSweet Research and Development, particularly in the areas of product development, analytical services, and sensory evaluation. Prior to that, as manager of Statistical Services at both NutraSweet and Best Foods, Inc., he worked closely with the sensory, analytical, and product development groups on the design and analysis of a full range of research studies in support of product development, QA/QC, and research guidance consumer tests.

Mr. Carr is a member of the U.S. delegation to the ISO TC34/SC12. He is actively involved in the statistical training of scientists and has been an invited speaker to several professional organizations on the topics of statistical methods and statistical consulting in industry. Since 1979, Mr. Carr has supported the development of new food ingredients, consumer food products, and OTC drugs by integrating the statistical and sensory evaluation functions into the mainstream of the product development effort. This has been accomplished through the application of a wide variety of statistical techniques including design of experiments, response surface methodology, mixture designs, sensory/instrumental correlation, and multivariate analysis.

Mr. Carr received his B.A. in mathematics from the University of Dayton and his Master's degree in statistics from Colorado State University.

Acknowledgments

We wish to thank our associates at work and our families at home for thoughts and ideas, for material assistance with typing and editing, and for emotional support. Many people have helped with suggestions and discussion over the years. Contributors at the concept stage were Andrew Dravnieks, Jean Eggert, Roland Harper, Derek Land, Elizabeth Larmond, Ann Noble, Rosemarie Pangborn, John J. Powers, Patricia Prell, and Elaine Skinner. Improvements in later editions were often suggested by readers and were given form with help from our colleagues from two Subcommittees on Sensory Evaluation, ASTM E-18 and ISO TC34/SC12, of whom we would like to single out Louise Aust, Donna Carlton, Daniel Ennis, Sylvie Issanchou, Sandy MacRae, Magni Martens, Suzanne Pecore, Benoit Rousseau, Rick Schifferstein, and Pascal Schlich. We also thank our colleagues Clare Dus, Kathy Foley, Kernon Gibes, Stephen Goodfellow, Dan Grabowski, Lynne Hare, Judy Heylman, Marura Lenjo, Marie Rudolph, Lee Stapleton, Ruta Ona Taylor, Julianna Visco, Gwyn Gibbs, Elizabeth Wilson, Annlyse Retiveau, and especially, Joanne Seltsam for help with editing, writing, illustrations, and ideas.

Contents

Chapter 1 Introduction to Sensory Techniques

1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Development of Sensory Testing.....	1
1.3 Human Subjects as Instruments.....	2
1.4 Conducting a Sensory Study	3
References	5

Chapter 2 Sensory Attributes and the Way We Perceive Them

2.1 Introduction	7
2.2 Sensory Attributes	7
2.3 The Human Senses	12
2.4 Perception at Threshold and Above.....	22
References	22

Chapter 3 Controls for Test Room, Products, and Panel

3.1 Introduction	25
3.2 Test Controls	25
3.3 Product Controls	34
3.4 Panelist Controls	37
References	38

Chapter 4 Factors Influencing Sensory Verdicts

4.1 Introduction	39
4.2 Physiological Factors	39
4.3 Psychological Factors	40
4.4 Poor Physical Condition	43
References	43

Chapter 5 Measuring Responses

5.1 Introduction	45
5.2 Psychophysical Theory	48
5.3 Classification.....	53
5.4 Grading.....	54
5.5 Ranking.....	55
5.6 Scaling.....	55
References	60

Chapter 6 Overall Difference Tests: Does a Sensory Difference Exist between Samples?

6.1	Introduction	63
6.2	The Unified Approach to Difference and Similarity Testing.....	63
6.3	Triangle Test.....	65
6.4	Duo-Trio Test.....	72
6.5	Two-out-of-Five Test.....	80
6.6	Same/Different Test (or Simple Difference Test)	84
6.7	“A”-“Not A” Test.....	88
6.8	Difference-from-Control Test	92
6.9	Sequential Tests	100
	References	104

Chapter 7 Attribute Difference Tests: How Does Attribute X Differ between Samples?

7.1	Introduction: Paired Comparison Designs	105
7.2	Directional Difference Test: Comparing Two Samples	105
7.3	Pairwise Ranking Test: Friedman Analysis—Comparing Several Samples in All Possible Pairs.....	109
7.4	Introduction: Multisample Difference Tests—Block Designs	112
7.5	Simple Ranking Test: Friedman Analysis—Randomized (Complete) Block Design	113
7.6	Multisample Difference Test: Rating Approach—Evaluation by Analysis of Variance (ANOVA)	117
7.7	Multisample Difference Test: BIB Ranking Test (Balanced Incomplete Block Design)—Friedman Analysis	122
7.8	Multisample Difference Test: BIB Rating Test (Balanced Incomplete Block Design)—Evaluation by Analysis of Variance	125
	References	128

Chapter 8 Determining Threshold

8.1	Introduction	129
8.2	Definitions	130
8.3	Applications of Threshold Determinations	132
	References	138

Chapter 9 Selection and Training of Panel Members

9.1	Introduction	141
9.2	Panel Development	141
9.3	Selection and Training for Difference Tests	143
9.4	Selection and Training of Panelists for Descriptive Testing	147
9.5	Panel Performance and Motivation	154
Appendix 9.1	Prescreening Questionnaires.....	157
Appendix 9.2	Panel Leadership Advice.....	165
	References	171

Chapter 10 Descriptive Analysis Techniques

10.1	Definition.....	173
10.2	Field of Application.....	173
10.3	Components of Descriptive Analysis.....	174
10.4	Commonly Used Descriptive Test Methods.....	178
10.5	Application of Descriptive Analysis Panel Data.....	183
	References.....	186

Chapter 11 The Spectrum™ Descriptive Analysis Method

11.1	Designing a Descriptive Procedure.....	189
11.2	Myths about the Spectrum Descriptive Analysis Method.....	189
11.3	Terminology.....	191
11.4	Intensity.....	192
11.5	Other Options.....	192
11.6	Modified Short-Version Spectrum Descriptive Procedures for Quality Assurance, Shelf-Life Studies, etc.....	193
Appendix 11.1	Spectrum Terminology for Descriptive Analysis.....	194
Appendix 11.2	Spectrum Intensity Scales for Descriptive Analysis.....	213
Appendix 11.3	A Streamlined Approach to Spectrum References.....	224
Appendix 11.4	Spectrum Descriptive Analysis Product Lexicons.....	232
Appendix 11.5	Spectrum Descriptive Analysis Examples of Full Product Descriptions.....	239
Appendix 11.6	Spectrum Descriptive Analysis Training Exercises.....	245
	References.....	253

Chapter 12 Affective Tests: Consumer Tests and In-House Panel Acceptance Tests

12.1	Purpose and Applications.....	255
12.2	The Subjects/Consumers in Affective Tests.....	259
12.3	Choice of Test Location.....	263
12.4	Affective Test Methods—Fuzzy Front End.....	265
12.5	Affective Methods: Qualitative.....	269
12.6	Affective Methods: Quantitative.....	271
12.7	Internet Research.....	281
12.8	Using Other Sensory Methods to Uncover Insights.....	283
Appendix 12.1	Screeners for Consumer Studies—Focus Group, CLT, and HUT.....	294
Appendix 12.2	Discussion Guide—Group or One-on-One Interviews.....	298
Appendix 12.3	Questionnaires for Consumer Studies.....	300
Appendix 12.4	Protocol Design for Consumer Studies.....	305
Appendix 12.5	Additional Fuzzy Front End References.....	308
	References.....	309

Chapter 13 Basic Statistical Methods

13.1	Introduction.....	313
13.2	Summarizing Sensory Data.....	314
13.3	Statistical Hypothesis Testing.....	323
13.4	Thurstonian Scaling.....	334

13.5	The Statistical Design of Sensory Panel Studies	338
13.6	Appendix on Probability	350
	References	355
Chapter 14 Advanced Statistical Methods		
14.1	Introduction	357
14.2	Data Relationships	357
14.3	Preference Mapping	375
14.4	The Treatment Structure of an Experimental Design	391
	References	404
Chapter 15 Guidelines for Choice of Technique		
15.1	Introduction	407
	Reference	412
Chapter 16 Guidelines for Reporting Results		
16.1	Introduction	413
16.2	Summary	413
16.3	Objective	413
16.4	Experimental	414
16.5	Results and Discussion	415
	References	417
Chapter 17 Statistical Tables.....		
		419
Index		
		441