

The Financial Numbers Game

Detecting Creative Accounting Practices

Charles W. Mulford

and

Eugene E. Comiskey



JOHN WILEY & SONS, INC.

About the Authors

Charles W. Mulford is the Invesco Chair and Professor of Accounting and Eugene E. Comiskey is the Callaway Chair and Professor of Accounting in the DuPree College of Management at the Georgia Institute of Technology in Atlanta. Both professors have doctorates in accounting and are professionally qualified as certified public accountants. In addition to their work at Georgia Tech, they actively consult with lenders at commercial banks in the United States and abroad. Professors Mulford and Comiskey have published articles on financial reporting and analysis issues in leading academic journals in the accounting and finance fields as well as in such widely read professional journals as the *Commercial Lending Review* and the *Financial Analysts' Journal*.

This is the authors' third book. Their first, *Financial Warnings*, published in 1996, identifies the warning signs of future corporate earnings difficulties. Their second, *Guide to Financial Reporting and Analysis*, seeks to simplify the complexities of current-day generally accepted accounting principles as an aid to practicing financial analysts and other users of financial statements.

Preface

With a certain mind-numbing frequency, users of financial statements—investors and creditors—find themselves buffeted with announcements of accounting irregularities. These irregularities are called many things, including aggressive accounting, earnings management, income smoothing, and fraudulent financial reporting. While they may vary in the degree to which they misreport financial results, they have similar effects—financial statements that serve as a foundation for important investment and credit decisions are incorrect, improper, and worse, misleading.

Companies of all sizes and types, from the start-up to the venerable, from those traded on the “Bulletin Board” to the “Big Board,” are susceptible to the problems we refer to here collectively as creative accounting practices. When these acts are discovered, adjustments are needed. Often, prior-year financial statements must be restated, sometimes more than once. Unfortunately, many learn of these accounting problems only after it is too late—after assessments of earning power have been reduced and share prices have fallen precipitously.

Aware that the proper functioning of our capital markets is dependent on the reliability and transparency of financial statements, the Securities and Exchange Commission (SEC) has taken important steps in recent years to rein in the problem. Calling the problem a “numbers game,” a former chairman of the SEC increased the enforcement actions taken by the Commission against accounting practices it considered to be errant. As an example of the SEC’s newly found diligence, during one month the agency instituted action against 68 individuals at 15 different companies.

Some would say the SEC has gone too far and has begun to question financial reporting practices that are well within the flexibility afforded by generally accepted accounting principles (GAAP). This appears to be a minority view. Moreover, attesting to a need for the SEC’s diligence, the problem of companies employing creative accounting practices in their financial reporting is continuing. And the problem will continue as long as there are measurable rewards, including positive effects on share prices, borrowing costs, bonus plans, and corporate regulations, to be gained by those who seek to play this financial numbers game.

The Financial Numbers Game: Detecting Creative Accounting Practices was written, first and foremost, to help readers of financial statements avoid being misled by financial results that have been altered with creative accounting practices. Key chapters conclude with checklists designed to help the reader discern when creative accounting practices have been employed. These checklists, and the text that supports them, were

Preface

developed with examples of hundreds of companies that were caught in the act of playing the financial numbers game.

Beyond its primary objective, the book provides a sense of perspective. It looks at the embedded flexibility within generally accepted accounting principles, why it is there, and how companies might use it to their advantage—sometimes pushing their financial reporting within that flexibility and other times pushing it well beyond. It looks at the role of the SEC in enforcing the securities laws and identifies the specific statutes used to prosecute those it considers to have pushed beyond the flexibility inherent in GAAP. It provides the results of a survey of important financial professionals, including equity analysts, lenders, and chief financial officers, among others, on their views of the propriety of many financial reporting practices and on the steps they use to detect creative accounting practices. The results of the survey are not always predictable and show disagreement not only between the groups but also within the groups as to which practices are appropriate and within GAAP boundaries, which ones go beyond them, and which ones actually constitute fraud.

The Financial Numbers Game: Detecting Creative Accounting Practices was written for serious readers of financial statements, whether equity analysts or investors, credit analysts or the credit professionals they serve, serious individual investors, or any parties whose interest in financial statements goes beyond the casual read. The steps outlined here should become a standard component of financial analysis and an important future reference, ultimately helping to answer the question: Do the numbers make sense?

A Special Note to Our Readers

As we went to press, the details of the accounting and reporting shortcomings at Enron Corp. that facilitated the company's demise were only beginning to come to light. Unfortunately, their investors and creditors had not fully discounted the risk associated with the firm's trading activities, its off-balance sheet liabilities, and its related-party transactions. Given our publication deadline, we were unable to incorporate a full accounting of the events that took place at the company. However, we do believe that careful attention to all the steps outlined in the checklists that conclude Chapter 8, "Misreported Assets and Liabilities," and Chapter 11, "Problems with Cash-Flow Reporting," would have provided an early alert to the possibility of developing problems.

Contents

1	Financial Numbers Game	1
	Rewards of the Game	2
	Classifying Creative Accounting Practices	8
	Plan of This Book	13
	Summary	14
	Glossary	15
	Notes	16
2	How the Game Is Played	19
	Accounting Policy Choice and Application	19
	Fraudulent Financial Reporting	39
	Cleaning Up after the Game	44
	Clarifying Terminology	49
	Summary	50
	Glossary	50
	Notes	52
3	Earnings Management: A Closer Look	57
	What Is Earnings Management?	58
	Incentives and Conditions for Earnings Management	60
	Earnings Management Techniques	62
	Evidence of Earnings Management	68
	Effectiveness of Earnings Management	74
	Is Earnings Management Good or Bad?	82
	Summary	84
	Glossary	86
	Notes	88

Contents

4	The SEC Responds	93
	The Chairman's Speech	93
	The Action Plan	96
	Subsequent Developments	99
	Enforcing the Securities Laws	108
	Summary	120
	Glossary	122
	Notes	123
5	Financial Professionals Speak Out	127
	Survey of Financial Professionals	129
	Survey Results	133
	Summary	156
	Glossary	157
	Notes	158
6	Recognizing Premature or Fictitious Revenue	159
	Is It Premature or Fictitious Revenue?	160
	When Should Revenue Be Recognized?	165
	Detecting Premature or Fictitious Revenue	185
	Checklist to Detect Premature or Fictitious Revenue	191
	Summary	193
	Glossary	194
	Notes	196
7	Aggressive Capitalization and Extended Amortization Policies	201
	Cost Capitalization	202
	Detecting Aggressive Cost Capitalization Policies	214
	Amortizing Capitalized Costs	220
	Detecting Extended Amortization Periods	226
	Checklist to Detect Aggressive Capitalization and Extended Amortization Policies	229
	Summary	231
	Glossary	231
	Notes	233
8	Misreported Assets and Liabilities	237
	Link with Reported Earnings	238
	Boosting Shareholders' Equity	239
	Overvalued Assets	240

Contents

Undervalued Liabilities	259
Checklist to Detect Misreported Assets and Liabilities	268
Summary	271
Glossary	272
Notes	275
9 Getting Creative with the Income Statement: Classification and Disclosure	279
Current Income Statement Requirements and Practices	280
Reporting Comprehensive Income	292
Creative Income Statement Classifications	295
Creativity with Other Aspects of the Income Statement	304
Summary	311
Glossary	312
Notes	313
10 Getting Creative with the Income Statement: Pro-Forma Measures of Earnings	317
Recasting the Bottom Line: Pro-Forma Earnings Measures	318
Summary	339
Glossary	340
Notes	341
11 Problems with Cash Flow Reporting	345
Reporting Cash Flow	347
Problems with Reported Operating Cash Flow	354
Using Operating Cash Flow to Detect Creative Accounting Practices	370
Checklist for Using Operating Cash Flow to Detect Creative Accounting Practices	373
Summary	373
Glossary	375
Notes	377
Subject Index	379
Company Index	391