## International Corporate Personhood

Business and the Bodyless in International Law

Kevin Crow



## Contents

|   | Introduction: the status quo   | 1  |
|---|--|----|
| 1 | The emergence of international corporate personhood  | 8  |
|   | <ul> <li>I. Definitions and distinctions 9</li> <li>a. Definitions 1</li> <li>II. The corporate trinity: state, Church, company 13</li> <li>III. A brief history of corporate personhood in three phases 19</li> <li>a. The Magistrate Charter Phase: pre-1850 19</li> <li>b. The public charter phase: 1850–1945 22</li> <li>c. The personhood phase: post-1945 26</li> <li>IV. Three conceptions of the ICP 29</li> <li>a. Para-individualist 29</li> <li>b. Para-statist 30</li> <li>c. Para-institutionalist 31</li> <li>V. Three incarnations of the ICP 31</li> <li>a. The organic or 'real entity' theory 32</li> <li>b. The positivist or concession theory 33</li> <li>c. The proxy or institutional theory 33</li> <li>VI. The separation of ownership and control 34</li> </ul> |    |
| 2 | VII. Discussion: a person composed of persons 35  The international corporate person in international law: judge-made law  | 44 |
|   | <ul> <li>I. Preface to the next two chapters 44</li> <li>II. The ICP in international tribunals 44</li> <li>i. Subjectivity of the corporation 45</li> <li>ii. Substantive rights 47</li> </ul>  |    |

|   | iii. Criminal liability of corporations 48                |    |
|---|---|----|
|   | iv. Alien Tort Statute 49                                 |    |
|   | v. Human rights 53  |    |
|   | vi. Environment 55  |    |
|   | vii. Intellectual property 58                             |    |
|   | viii. Clean hands and corruption 59                       |    |
|   | ix. Importing rights through the New York Convention 60   |    |
|   | III. Conceptualizing judge-made ICP obligations:          |    |
|   | erga omnes v. jus cogens 62                               |    |
|   | a. Erga omnes 63  |    |
|   | b. Jus cogens 64  |    |
| 3 | The international corporate person in international law:  |    |
|   | texts and practices                                       | 71 |
|   | I. Exclusivity and the text 71                            |    |
|   | II. The ICP in international legal texts and practices 72 |    |
|   | a. Business and Human Rights 72                           |    |
|   | i. The European Convention on Human Rights                |    |
|   | and the European Court of Human Rights 72                 |    |
|   | ii. The protect, respect, and remedy framework 73         |    |
|   | iii. The OEIGWG draft binding instrument 75               |    |
|   | iv. The Hague Rules on Business                           |    |
|   | and Human Rights arbitration 78                           |    |
|   | b. International criminal law 80                          |    |
|   | i. The joint criminal enterprise and aiding               |    |
|   | and abetting 80   |    |
|   | ii. Environmental harm as a crime against humanity 83     |    |
|   | c. International anti-corruption texts and practices 85   |    |
|   | i. Explicit international anti-corruption instruments 86  |    |
|   | ii. Transfer pricing 90                                   |    |
|   | iii. Tax havens 94  |    |
|   | iv. Deferred prosecution agreements 95                    |    |
|   | d. Environmental law 96                                   |    |
|   | i. Stockholm 97   |    |
|   | ii. Rio and aftermath 97                                  |    |
|   | e. International economic law 99                          |    |
|   | i. Legacies of the new international legal order 99       |    |
|   | ii. 'Development' and the ICP 103                         |    |
|   | f. OECD guidelines for multinational enterprises 106      |    |

| III. The modern ICP's role in 'authoring' international law 107       |     |
|---|-----|
| a. 'Consultant' or 'observer' status 107                              |     |
| b. The WTO's TRIPS agreement 109                                      |     |
| c. CEO preferences and political spending 111                         |     |
| IV. No analogies: the ICP's unique status under international law 113 |     |
| Theorizing international corporate personhood                         | 124 |
| I. Conceptualizing the international corporate person 126             |     |
| a. Corporate exceptionalism 126                                       |     |
| b. Beyond state, individual, and institution 128                      |     |
| c. Human problems and corporate conceptions 129                       |     |
| II. Constituency and sovereignty as human problems 133                |     |
| a. Constituency: IEL as a case study 133                              |     |
| b. Sovereignty as a strategy 140                                      |     |
| III. The public–private delusion 144                                  |     |
| a. Background 146   |     |
| b. Insurance and SOEs: examples from international                    |     |
| economic law 149  |     |
| c. Sovereignty and the veil 152                                       |     |
| IV. The ICP and a bundle of sticks 155                                |     |
| a. Duties: civil and criminal 156                                     |     |
| b. The amorphous liability of corporate groups                        |     |
| and networks 158  |     |
| c. Hume and Hohfeld 160   |     |
| V. Toward a theory of the ICP 161                                     |     |
| VI. Changing gears: a summary thus far 164                            |     |
| Political bodies and the bodyless                                     | 175 |
| I. Political bodies and the bodyless 175                              |     |
| II. Persons as disjointed things 176                                  |     |
| a. The ICP and GVCs 176   |     |
| b. The ICP and CSR 180  |     |
| III. Things as disenfranchised persons 181                            |     |
| a. Nature 182   |     |
| b. Animals and AI 183   |     |
| IV. 'The actual': liability 185                                       |     |
| a. Legal form and liability 185                                       |     |
| b. Territory and liability 188  |     |
| c. Liability in private normative orders 190                          |     |
|   |     |

Index

| V. 'The possible': reform 191                                |
|--|
| a. Establishing new regimes: human rights                    |
| and environment 192  |
| b. Global economic law: taxation and wealth registration 193 |
| c. Structural reform: governance and forbearance 195         |
| Codetermination 195  |
| Collective decision making 196                               |
| Keiretsu 196   |
| d. Feminist political theory and the ICP 197                 |
| e. Anthropocentrism, sovereignty, and the ICP 198            |
| Conclusion: beyond sovereignty, beyond the veil              |

206

211