

# **Philosophy of Law**

## An Introduction

Third edition

**Mark Tebbit**

# Contents

<i>Preface to third edition</i>	x
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xi
<b>PART I</b>	
<b>What is the law?</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>1 Morality, justice and natural law</b>	<b>3</b>
<i>Morality and law at variance</i>	3
<i>What is justice?</i>	6
<i>Natural law theory and legal positivism</i>	9
<i>Traditional natural law theory</i>	11
<i>Conclusion</i>	18
<i>Suggestions for further reading</i>	19
<b>2 From common law to modern positivism</b>	<b>20</b>
<i>Common law today</i>	20
<i>Early positivism: an age of philosophical transition</i>	23
<i>Austin's legal positivism</i>	26
<i>Austin's command theory</i>	28
<i>Conclusion</i>	33
<i>Suggestions for further reading</i>	33
<b>3 Hart's legal positivism</b>	<b>35</b>
<i>Hart's challenge to Austin</i>	35
<i>Legal and moral obligation</i>	36
<i>Internalisation</i>	37
<i>Conventions and obligations</i>	39
<i>Minimal natural law</i>	40
<i>Primary and secondary rules</i>	41
<i>The rule of recognition</i>	41

<i>Positivist doubts about Hart's system of rules</i>	42
<i>Conclusion</i>	44
<i>Suggestions for further reading</i>	45
<b>4 Legal theory and the Nazi legality problem</b>	<b>46</b>
<i>Hans Kelsen's pure theory of law</i>	47
<i>Radbruch against Kelsen</i>	51
<i>Fuller's secular version of natural law</i>	53
<i>The problem of Nazi legality</i>	57
<i>Conclusion</i>	59
<i>Suggestions for further reading</i>	60
<b>5 Legal realism</b>	<b>61</b>
<i>Pragmatism and legal realism</i>	61
<i>Who were the realists?</i>	61
<i>Legal theory and judicial practice</i>	62
<i>The pragmatist attack on certainty</i>	64
<i>The realist revolt against formalism</i>	67
<i>Abductive inference to the best explanation</i>	69
<i>Realism and rule-scepticism</i>	70
<i>The pragmatics of justice</i>	74
<i>Hart's criticism</i>	76
<i>Conclusion</i>	77
<i>Suggestions for further reading</i>	78
<b>6 Competing images of law in contemporary jurisprudence</b>	<b>79</b>
<i>Austin and Hart on hard cases</i>	79
<i>Dworkin's theory of law as integrity</i>	81
<i>Criticisms of Dworkin</i>	89
<i>Conclusion</i>	97
<i>Suggestions for further reading</i>	98
<b>7 Radical challenges to mainstream theory</b>	<b>99</b>
<i>The roots of modernity and the Enlightenment</i>	99
<i>Critics of the Enlightenment</i>	101
<i>The postmodernist attack on modernity</i>	103
<i>Critical legal studies</i>	107
<i>The contradictions in liberalism</i>	110
<i>Justice modern and postmodern</i>	114
<i>Conclusion: perspectivism and truth</i>	115
<i>Suggestions for further reading</i>	117

**PART II**

<b>The reach of the law</b>	<b>119</b>
<b>8 Obedience and disobedience</b>	<b>121</b>
<i>Should we respect the law as law?</i>	121
<i>Natural law and positivist responses</i>	122
<i>H.D. Thoreau: conscience as the sole basis for obligation</i>	124
<i>Socrates' arguments in Plato's Crito</i>	125
<i>Consequentialist arguments for conditional obedience</i>	128
<i>Classical contract theory</i>	130
<i>Rawls: the original position and the conditional duty to obey</i>	133
<i>Injustice and civil disobedience</i>	136
<i>Conclusion</i>	142
<i>Suggestions for further reading</i>	142
<b>9 Legal and moral rights</b>	<b>144</b>
<i>Rights and rights-scepticism</i>	146
<i>Responses to rights-scepticism</i>	150
<i>Absolute rights</i>	153
<i>Rights versus utility – Bentham and J.S. Mill</i>	154
<i>Dworkin's theory of rights</i>	156
<i>The HRA (1998) and the case of the conjoined twins</i>	158
<i>Conclusion</i>	160
<i>Suggestions for further reading</i>	160
<b>10 Law and private morals</b>	<b>162</b>
<i>Liberalisation and the Wolfenden Report</i>	162
<i>J.S. Mill and liberty</i>	163
<i>Devlin's critique of the Wolfenden Report</i>	166
<i>Hart's reply to Devlin</i>	169
<i>Dworkin's critique of Devlin</i>	172
<i>Conclusion</i>	173
<i>Suggestions for further reading</i>	174
<b>11 Radical critiques of liberal theories of law</b>	<b>175</b>
<i>The liberal concept of the individual</i>	175
<i>The contextualisation of universal rights</i>	178
<i>Marx and Marxism</i>	180
<i>Feminist jurisprudence and the rights of women</i>	181
<i>Rights in relation to class, sex and race</i>	187
<i>Conclusion</i>	188
<i>Suggestions for further reading</i>	189

**PART III**

<b>Criminal responsibility and punishment</b>	<b>191</b>
<b>12 Guilty minds: Recklessness, manslaughter and murder</b>	<b>193</b>
<i>Criminal responsibility and the mens rea doctrine in English common law</i> 193	
<i>Negligence and recklessness</i> 194	
<i>Intentional killing and murder</i> 198	
<i>Direct and oblique intention</i> 203	
<i>The subjective–objective controversy</i> 207	
<i>Conclusion</i> 211	
<i>Suggestions for further reading</i> 212	
<b>13 Unlawful killing: The defences of necessity and duress</b>	<b>213</b>
<i>The defence of duress</i> 213	
<i>DPP v. Lynch (1975)</i> 216	
<i>The defence of necessity</i> 218	
<i>Should the Hale authority allow any exceptions?</i> 224	
<i>Intention and necessity</i> 227	
<i>Conclusion</i> 229	
<i>Suggestions for further reading</i> 230	
<b>14 Insanity and diminished responsibility</b>	<b>231</b>
<i>Traditional problems with insanity</i> 232	
<i>The case of Daniel M’Naghten</i> 234	
<i>The M’Naghten Rules and their critics</i> 235	
<i>Diminished responsibility and the 1957 Homicide Act</i> 240	
<i>Conclusion</i> 241	
<i>Suggestions for further reading</i> 241	
<b>15 Theories of punishment</b>	<b>242</b>
<i>The problem of justification</i> 242	
<i>Punishment justified by its effects</i> 243	
<i>Justifying punishment retrospectively</i> 245	
<i>Criticisms of the traditional theories</i> 246	
<i>Modifications and compromises</i> 250	
<i>Lex talionis and unfair advantage</i> 252	
<i>Punishment as communication: Nozick and Hampton</i> 254	
<i>Desert and deterrence in sentencing</i> 258	
<i>Conclusion</i> 260	
<i>Suggestions for further reading</i> 261	

<b>16 Radical perspectives on crime and punishment</b>	<b>263</b>
<i>Enlightenment liberalism and its critics</i>	263
<i>Intention and mens rea</i>	268
<i>Critical perspectives on criminal law and insanity</i>	270
<i>Feminist criticisms of criminal law</i>	272
<i>An assessment of the critical theories</i>	275
<i>Conclusion: Enlightenment values and the rule of law</i>	277
<i>Suggestions for further reading</i>	279
<i>Appendix</i>	280
<i>Glossary</i>	282
<i>Bibliography</i>	285
<i>Index</i>	298