

COMPARATIVE LAW IN A CHANGING WORLD

Second edition

Peter de Cruz, LLB, LLM, PhD
Professor of Law
Staffordshire University



Cavendish
Publishing
Limited

London • Sydney

CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i>	<i>v</i>	
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	<i>xix</i>	
1	INTRODUCING COMPARATIVE LAW	1
	Introduction	1
	Definitions and derivations	3
	Terminology: subject or method?	3
	The elements of 'comparative law'	7
	Comparative law distinguished from other disciplines	7
	Private international law and comparative law	8
	Public international law and comparative law	9
	Legal history, legal ethnology and comparative law	9
	Sociology of law and comparative law	10
	A rationale for comparative law	10
	The origins of comparative law	11
	Early comparative law	11
	The roots of comparative law	13
	Comparative law in England	16
	The contemporary significance of comparative law	18
	Functions and purposes of comparative law	18
	Comparative law as an academic discipline	18
	Comparative law as an academic tradition	19
	Using comparative law in research	19
	A tool of construction	21
	Aid to understanding legal rules	22
	The African situation	24
	The international law dimension	24
	Key concepts in the comparative law method	26
	The parent legal family and legal traditions	26
	Sources of law	28
	Comparative law method	29
	Selective bibliography	30
2	THE CLASSIFICATION OF LEGAL SYSTEMS	
	INTO LEGAL FAMILIES	33
	Terminology	33
	Legal traditions and legal families	33
	Classification of legal systems	34
	Criteria used to classify legal systems	36
	Examination and application of the criteria	36
	Historical development	36
	Mode of legal thinking	38

	Distinctive legal institutions	39
	Choice of sources of law	40
	Ideology of a legal system	40
	Convergence theory and legal unity	41
	Selective bibliography	42
3	THE CIVIL LAW SYSTEM	43
	Terminology	43
	Different meanings of 'civil law'	43
	Meaning of codification in the civil law context	46
	Historical development of the civil law tradition	47
	Roman law and Western civilisation	47
	History of French law	59
	Structure and overview of the French Civil Code	64
	Sources of law	66
	Doctrine	67
	Status of judicial decisions (jurisprudence) in French law	68
	Key features of the French legal system	69
	Public and private law	74
	Distinctive French legal doctrines and concepts	77
	History of German law	79
	Application of the BGB	90
	Overview of the civil law tradition	95
	Selective bibliography	96
4	THE ENGLISH COMMON LAW SYSTEM	99
	Introduction	99
	Terminology	101
	The English common law tradition	102
	The common law in the United States	107
	Preliminary observations	107
	Linguistic issues	108
	History of American law: some observations	108
	Uniformity and diversity in American law	114
	Comparative overview	118
	The common law tradition in South East Asia	118
	Historical introduction to the English legal world in South East Asia	119
	Reception of English law in Singapore and Malaysia	121
	Reception of English law in Singapore	122
	Reception of English law in Malaysia	123
	The common law in India	125
	The common law in the Far East: Hong Kong	127

Contents

New legislative formula	128
Hong Kong after 1997	129
Can socialism and capitalism co-exist?	131
The future of the common law in Hong Kong	132
Comparative overview	136
Selective bibliography	137
5 EUROPEAN COMMUNITY LAW	139
Introduction	139
Scope of chapter	140
Monism, dualism and accession of Britain	140
The Single European Act 1986	144
The institutional framework of the Community	144
EC institutions and traditional international organisations	145
The Council of Ministers	146
The European Commission	147
The European Parliament	149
The European Court of Justice	150
Difficulties in comparison	156
Comparison of legal style	
of Community law with other systems	157
The influence of French law	158
The influence of German law	160
The influence of the common law tradition	161
The language of Community law	162
Legislation as language	163
The Community's legal order/regime	164
Nature of Community law	164
Direct applicability and direct effect	165
Supremacy of Community law	168
Community techniques of legal interpretation	169
Distinctive legal institutions/doctrines	170
Choice of sources of law	171
Ideology of the system	172
The Maastricht Treaty	174
The general aims of the Treaty	175
Steps to European Union	175
Subsidiarity	175
European citizenship	176
A single economy	176
Powers of the European Parliament	176
Education	176
Culture	177
Justice and Home Affairs	177

The Social Chapter and social policy	177
Conclusions	178
Selective bibliography	180
6 SOCIALIST LAW AND OTHER TYPES	
OF LEGAL SYSTEMS	183
Scope of chapter	183
The socialist system and Russia	183
The socialist concept of law	184
Differences between civil law and socialist systems	186
Similarities between civil law and socialist systems	186
Was the socialist system part of the civil law system?	188
Inquest on the Russian Empire	189
The end of the USSR and the new Russian Federation	190
Russian law – return to civil law or hybrid system?	191
Towards a Russian social democratic State?	200
Other recent developments	201
Hybrid legal systems	202
Other types of law	203
Eastern legal conceptions	203
The Chinese conception of law	204
The Japanese conception of law	207
Selective bibliography	212
7 TECHNIQUES OF COMPARATIVE LAW	213
Scope of chapter	213
General considerations	213
Linguistic/terminological problems	214
Cultural differences between systems	216
Arbitrary selection of objects of study	219
‘Comparability’ in comparison	220
Viability of theory of a common legal pattern	222
Imposition of one’s own legal conceptions	223
Omission of extra-legal factors	224
The quest for methodology	225
Introduction	225
Clarifying the general character of comparative law	225
The subject matter of the comparison	226
Macro-comparison and micro-comparison	227
Suitability of topics for micro-comparison	228
Comparative method: requirements	228
The test of functionality	230
The comparative law method	233

A three stage approach	233
A method of comparison: a blueprint	235
Selective bibliography	240
8 A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF JUDICIAL STYLES AND CASE LAW	243
The meaning of 'case law'	243
Case law as a source of law	243
Key issues	244
The authority of case law in non-common law jurisdictions	244
The authority of case law in non-common law countries	244
Styles of judicial decisions	247
Appellate court decisions	247
The five styles of judgments	247
<i>Ratio and dicta</i>	248
The French style of judgment	252
The German style of judgment	254
General style of Federal Supreme Court judgments	256
The Swedish type of judgment	258
The relevance of overriding general principles	259
<i>Aequitas</i>	259
Selective bibliography	263
9 A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF STATUTORY INTERPRETATION	265
Defining 'statutory interpretation'	265
Defining 'interpretation'	265
General comparative observations	265
Methods/techniques of statutory interpretation	267
Civil law approaches	267
The logical interpretation methodology	267
The legislative history approach	269
The teleological approach	270
Scope and limitations of the teleological approach	270
Common law approaches to statutory interpretation	271
Inadmissible evidence of statutory intent	272
Summary of legislative history position	274
The mischief rule	275
Filling gaps in a statute	277
Other linguistic canons of construction/interpretation	278
Presumptions and precedents	280
Conflict of statutes with other legal principles	281
Scholarly/doctrinal writing in English	281

statutory interpretation	282
Typical structure of English statutes	283
Comparative overview	284
Similarities in approaches between legal systems	285
Common judicial arguments on statutory interpretation	286
Differences in statutory interpretation between the systems	287
Conclusions	290
Selective bibliography	290
10 THE LAW OF OBLIGATIONS: A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF CONTRACT AND TORT	293
Introduction	293
Historical development: a comparative analysis	294
The early Roman law of obligations	294
Contracts	294
Origins of the modern English law of contract	300
Tortious or delictual liability	304
Law of obligations: contract in civil law	308
Tort and contract: contemporary comparative aspects	312
Formation of contracts	312
German law	314
French law	317
German law	318
English law	319
Scope of tortious liability	320
American law	324
Civil law	325
Tort law and traffic accidents	331
French law	331
English law	332
German law	333
Fault in the law of contract and tort	334
Interaction of tort and contract	336
Comparative overview	338
Selective bibliography	339
11 CORPORATE AND COMMERCIAL LAW	341
Scope of analysis	341
Problems in comparison of company laws	342
Key conceptual questions	342
Paillusseau's enterprise notion	344
Forms of business organisation: a comparative overview	345
Corporate terminology in France and Germany	345

Companies and contracts	349
Partnership law	351
Company law in France	354
Legislative sources of law	356
Incorporation of a société	356
Status of a société pending incorporation	357
SAs and SARLs	357
Société à responsabilité limitée (SARL)	358
The GIE and the GEIE	359
Company law in Germany	362
Types of business organisation	363
Partnerships and sole traders	364
Sole traders	364
Partnerships	365
The silent partnership	368
Limited companies and public limited companies	368
A comparative overview of agency	371
Historical origins	371
Modern agency law: common law v civil law	373
European Community corporate law	377
The notion of European Community (EC) law	377
The <i>Daily Mail</i> case	378
Non-profit making undertakings	378
Removal of restrictions on freedom of movement	378
Statutory foundations of harmonisation of laws	379
Nature of EC company law	379
Directives already in force in the United Kingdom	380
Comparative corporate law: conclusions	380
Selective bibliography	381
12 SALE OF GOODS	383
Introduction	383
The historical background	384
Sale of goods in Roman law	384
The law merchant	385
Key issues in sales of goods	387
Comparative study of European civil law countries	388
French law	388
German law	394
Remedies of buyer and seller	398
Contributory fault in damages	400
Seller's remedies	402
The English common law approach	404
General	404

	Definition of goods under English law	405
	Transfer of property and transfer of ownership	406
	Transfer of ownership and risk of loss	407
	The <i>Romalpa</i> case	415
	Effect of the <i>Romalpa</i> case	415
	Principle of the <i>Romalpa</i> case	416
	Delivery at seller's own risk	417
	Duties of buyer and seller	417
	Remedies of the buyer and seller	430
	The Supply of Goods and Services Act 1982	434
	The uniform laws on international sales	436
	Meaning of 'international sale'	437
	Sale of goods	438
	Validity and passing of property excluded	443
	Interpretation of the Convention	443
	Ratifications	444
	Comparative overview	445
	Selective Bibliography	446
13	LABOUR LAW	449
	Scope of chapter	449
	Historical development	449
	Great Britain	449
	Germany	452
	France	463
	Comparative overview	472
	Selective bibliography	474
14	A NEW WORLD ORDER?	475
	Introduction	475
	The significance of legal history	477
	A new world order?	478
	Global wars and civil strife: historical perspectives	478
	Reasons for the transformation of the world order	479
	Reasons for the fall of communism in Eastern Europe	480
	Theories of convergence	481
	Current convergent trends	481
	European convergence	482
	Philosophies of convergence	485
	The <i>jus commune</i> theory	485
	Global convergence and the Fukuyama thesis	488
	Unification of legal systems	490

Contents

Strategies of convergence	490
Legal transplants	491
Natural convergence	491
Convergence and divergence between common law and civil law	492
Convergence between European countries	493
The dawn of a new era in world history	494
Conclusions	495
Selective bibliography	496
<i>Index</i>	499