Principles of Linguistic Change

VOLUME 3: COGNITIVE AND CULTURAL FACTORS

William Labov



A John Wiley & Sons, Ltd., Publication

Contents

List of Figures		xii	
List of Tables			xxi
Fore	Foreword		
Pref	ace		xxvi
Abb	reviation	ns	xxvii
1	Introdu	action to Cognitive and Cultural Factors in Linguistic Change	1
	1.1	Cognitive Factors	1
	1.2	Cultural Factors in Linguistic Change	2
	1.3	Convergence and Divergence	4
	1.4	The Darwinian Paradox Revisited	6
	1.5	Divergence and the Central Dogma	7
	1.6	The Community Orientation of Language Learning	8
	1.7	The Argument of this Volume	10
	1.8	The English Vowel System and the Major Chain Shifts	
		of North American English	11
Part	A Cro	oss-Dialectal Comprehension	19
2	Natural Misunderstandings		21
	2.1	The Collection of Natural Misunderstandings	22
	2.2	Modes of Correction	23
	2.3	How Common Are Misunderstandings?	26
	2.4	What Is the Role of Sound Change in Misunderstanding?	27
	2.5	The Linguistic Focus of the Misunderstandings	28
	2.6	The Effect of Mergers	33
	2.7	Chain Shifts	37
	2.8	Philadelphia Sound Changes	40
	2.9	r-less vs r-ful Dialects	44
	2.10	Sound Changes General to North America	45
	2.11	An Overview of Natural Misunderstandings	46

Contents

3	A Controlled Experiment on Vowel Identification			
	3.1	The Peterson–Barney Experiment	49	
	3.2	Replicating the Peterson-Barney Experiment	49	
	3.3	Overall Success in Identification	52	
	3.4	Responses to the Chicago Speakers	52	
	3.5	Responses to the Birmingham Speakers	54	
	3.6	Responses to the Philadelphia Speakers	56	
	3.7	Overview	57	
4	The Gating Experiments			
	4.1	Construction of the Gating Experiments	59	
	4.2	Overall Responses to the Gating Experiments	60	
	4.3	Comprehension of the Northern Cities Shift in Chicago	64	
	4.4	Recognition of Chicago Sound Changes in the Word Context	69	
	4.5	The Effect of Lexical Equivalence	71	
	4.6	Comprehension of Southern Sound Changes in Birmingham	72	
	4.7	Comprehension of Philadelphia Sound Changes	77	
	4.8	Overview of the Gating Experiments	83	
Par	tВΊ	The Life History of Linguistic Change	87	
5	Triggering Events			
	5.1	Bends in the Chain of Causality	90	
	5.2	Causes of the Canadian Shift	93	
	5.3	Causes of the Pittsburgh Shift	96	
	5.4	Causes of the Low Back Merger	99	
	5.5	The Fronting of /uw/	103	
	5.6	The Northern Cities Shift	111	
	5.7	An Overview of Triggering Events	118	
6	Governing Principles		120	
	6.1	The Constraints Problem	120	
	6.2	The (Ir)Reversibility of Mergers	121	
	6.3	The Geographic Expansion of Mergers in North America	130	
	6.4	Principles Governing Chain Shifts	140	
	6.5	Principles Governing Chain Shifting within Subsystems	145	
	6.6	How Well Do Governing Principles Govern?	152	
7	Forks in the Road			
	7.1	The Concept of Forks in the Road	155	
	7.2	The Two-Stage Model of Dialect Divergence	156	
	7.3	The Fronting and Backing of Short a	157	
	7.4	Divergent Development of the /o/ ~ /oh/ Opposition	161	

viii

Contents	
Gomenis	

8	Diverg	gence	165
	8.1	Continuous and Discrete Boundaries	165
	8.2	The North/Midland Boundary	166
	8.3	Communication across the North/Midland Boundary	170
	8.4	The Two-Step Mechanism of Divergence	172
	8.5	Unidirectional Change: The Low Back Merger	173
	8.6	Consequences of the Low Back Merger for the English	
		Vowel System	174
	8.7	Resistance to the Low Back Merger	175
	8.8	Further Differentiation by Chain Shifts	180
	8.9	A General View of Linguistic Divergence in North America	182
9	Drivin	g Forces	184
	9.1	The Importation of Norms	185
	9.2	Locality	185
	9.3	Social Networks and Communities of Practice	186
	9.4	Socioeconomic Classes	190
	9.5	Acts of Identity	193
	9.6	The Relation of Social Classes in Apparent Time	195
	9.7	Gender as a Social Force	197
	9.8	The Regional Dialect	202
	9.9	Accounting for the Uniform Progress of the Northern Cities Shift	204
10	Yanke	e Cultural Imperialism and the Northern Cities Shift	208
	10.1	The North/Midland Boundary	208
	10.2	The History of the North/Midland Boundary	211
	10.3	The Material Basis of the North/Midland Opposition	214
	10.4	The Cultural Opposition of Yankees and Upland Southerners	216
	10.5	Coincidence with Geographic Boundaries of Political Cultures	218
	10.6	Red States, Blue States, and the Northern Dialect Region	221
	10.7	Relation of Dialects to County Voting Patterns	222
	10.8	The History of the Death Penalty	225
	10.9	Ideological Oppositions in the North	227
	10.10	The Geographic Transformation	231
11	Social	Evaluation of the Northern Cities Shift	236
	11.1	The North/Midland Experiment 1	237
	11.2	Conclusion	244
12	Endpoints		245
	12.1	Skewness as an Index of Approach to Endpoint	246
	12.2	Social Characteristics of Endpoints	249

ix

	12.3	The Eckert Progression as the Product of Re-Analysis by	
		Language Learners	254
Par	t C T	he Unit of Linguistic Change	257
13	Words	Floating on the Surface of Sound Change	259
	13.1	The Issues Reviewed	260
	13.2	The Fronting of /uw/	261
	13.3	The Fronting of /ow/	268
	13.4	Homonyms	273
	13.5	The Raising and Fronting of $/\alpha/$ in the Inland North	274
	13.6	Overview	277
	13.7	Participation in Sound Change	277
	13.8	The Modular Separation of Phonological and Social Factors	282
	13.9	Conclusion	285
14		inding Force in Segmental Phonology	287
	14.1	Is There Allophonic Chain Shifting before Nasals?	292
	14.2	Allophonic Chain Shifting in the Southern Shift?	295
	14.3	The Binding Force	301
Par	tD T	ransmission and Diffusion	303
15	The D	Diffusion of Language from Place to Place	305
	15.1	Family-Tree and Wave Models of Change	305
	15.2	Defining Transmission and Diffusion	307
	15.3	Structural Diffusion	310
	15.4	Accounting for the Difference between Transmission	
		and Diffusion	311
	15.5	Diffusion in Dialect Geography	311
	15.6	The Diffusion of the NYC Short-a System	316
	15.7	The Transmission and Diffusion of Mergers and Splits	334
	15.8	Diffusion of the Northern Cities Shift	336
	15.9	The Social Context of Transmission and Diffusion	344
	15.10	Prospectus	347
16	The Diffusion of Language from Group to Group		348
	16.1	Diffusion to the AAVE Community	348
	16.2	Influence of Surrounding Dialects on AAVE Pronunciation	349
	16.3	The Diffusion of Constraints on $-t$, d Deletion to Children	
		in Minority Communities	353
	16.4	The Diffusion of Grammatical Variables to Adult Members	
		of the African–American Community	360

х

		Contents	xi
	16.5	Directions of Diffusion in the Latino Community	363
	16.6	The Nature of Diffusion across Communal Boundaries	365
17	Conclusion		367
	17.1	Summary of the Argument	367
	17.2	The Relation of Linguistic Change to Animal Systems of	
		Communication	369
	17.3	More on the Functions of Language	371
	17.4	Social Intelligence and Object-Oriented Intelligence	373
Notes			376
References			394
Index			413